International Journal of Public Health Asia Pacific
Open Access: e-Journal
ISSN: xxxx-xxxx (Online)

The Evaluation of Quality Improvement Criteria of Tambon Health Promoting Hospital (Star Hospital), Surat Thani Province

Suwadee Sangkom[1*]

[1]Master of Public Administration, Senior Professional Level of plan and policy analysis, Surat Thani Provincial Health Office

*Corresponding author: Suwadee Sangkom, knp_surat@hotmail.com

ABSTRACT

Background: Thailand government has announced a policy to improve the health service system to have better quality and be more effective. Surat Thani Provincial Public Health Office has operated according to the policy of assessment and development for the quality criteria of Star sub-district health promoting hospital which has been operating since 2017. There is still a lack of information about factors related to operations and satisfaction of the service users to support the management system. To provide people with equal access to services, it is necessary to assess the quality development of Star Hospital.

Objectives: This evaluation study aimed to evaluate the quality improvement criteria of Tambon Health Promoting Hospital (Star Hospital) in Surat Thani Province.

Methods: 166 places of Tambon Health Promoting Hospital of Surat Thani have been selected by using work manual for quality improvement criteria of Tambon Health Promoting Hospital (Star Hospital) between 2019-2021. 17 directors of Tambon Health Promoting Hospital were interviewed in-depth and 68 staffs responded the questionnaire including context, input, process and outcome of an operation of Star Hospital criteria. 400 participants responded the perception of self-care and satisfaction questionnaire. Descriptive statistics including frequency percentage, mean, minimum, maximum and standard deviation were used to analyze the data and content analysis were used to analyze the quantitative data.

Results: CIPP model observed that the hospital has a policy with clear guideline for development, has developed infrastructure and people have access to more services resulting in reduction of the use of outpatient services. However, there were insufficient staffs, no multidisciplinary team and budget, no MOU for working group at the district level, limited integration with partners. The level of Star Hospital criteria was high of context, input, process and product with average score of 18.6 (S.D=2.2), 34.1 (S.D=2.9), 39.3 (S.D=3.9) and 30.3 (S.D=2.9) respectively. Similarly, part of perception of self-care were high levels with 58.5% average score 13.7 (S.D=2.9, Min -Max =14-17). The satisfaction scores were high level with 95.3% average score 61.2 (S.D = 4.6, Min-Max= 38-66).

Conclusion: Inputs should be provided including; personal, budget and material from network hospital for developing quality of service system and enhancing participation from all sectors including public sector, private sector, and people in the community

Keywords: Project Evaluation, Tambon Health Promoting Hospital

1. Introduction

The government has announced a policy to improve the health service system to have better quality and make more effective. Ministry of Health has formulated a strategic plan to develop excellence in 4 areas: 1) Health promotion and disease prevention (P&P Excellence) 2) Service System (Service Excellence) 3) Development of People (People Excellence) 4) Management System (Governance Excellence) [1]. The management system has developed the quality of Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (Subdistrict Hospital) by using the criteria of Star Subdistrict Health Promoting Hospital since 2017. In this regard, the assessment criteria for Star Hospital has developed quality criteria (Approach) (District Health System: DHS) [2].

Criteria for evaluating Star Hospital will receive standardized services in five issues: (1) good management (2) good coordination between parties (3) good personnel, (4) good service, and (5) people were healthy and promote the role of local people to take part in the development of Sub-district Hospital to have more potential and quality as well as increasing the capacity of people to take care of their own health, family, and community until they can be self-reliant in health according to the Sufficiency Economy Philosophy [3-6].

Surat Thani Provincial Public Health Office has operated according to the policy of assessment and development as per the quality criteria of sub-district health promoting hospitals. Star Hospital, with the results of 2017, passed the provincial assessment criteria of 43 places, representing 25.9%. In 2018, it passed the cumulative criteria of 77 places, representing 46.38%, and in 2019, passed the cumulative provincial assessment criteria of 116 places, representing 69.8% [7]. There is still a lack of information to support the management system. Factors related to operations such as personnel, budget, operating processes and the effect of health promotion services and prevent disease in various areas, including access to services, reducing problems or complications of illness, behavior modification, disease reduction, risk reduction of people in the community and the satisfaction of the people in order to develop the sub-district hospital to provide health services to people in sub-districts, villages, communities, and to develop the public health system to have higher quality standards and more potential by focusing on proactive health services to provide people with equal access to services. Therefore, it is necessary to assess the performance of quality development of the hospital. Hence, this present study was designed to assess the context, inputs, processes, and outputs for quality improvement operations of Star Sub-District Health Promoting Hospital in Surat Thani Province [8-10].

2. Methods

This was an evaluation study to assess the context, inputs, processes, and outputs (CIPP) in the quality development of Star Hospital, Surat Thani Province which applied the model of Stufflebeam's CIPP Model of Evaluation [11].

The population studied in this study were

1) 166 Sub-district Hospitals in Surat Thani Province, consisted of 45 small (S) hospitals, 109 Medium-sized (M) hospitals and 12 large-scale hospitals (L) where the informants were the executives such as Director of the Provincial Hospital, operators in the Hospital, professional nurses, public health scholar, public health officer, Thai traditional medicine practitioner and dentistry

2) Service recipients including people who came to receive services at the Surat Thani Hospital between July and September 2022.

The tools used in this study consisted of Executive interview forms using context, inputs, processes, and output, and operational limitations and policy recommendations for the implementation of quality development of the hospital, and Worker's questionnaire about Opinions on the quality improvement operation in terms of context, supporting factors, process, and productivity were measured at 3 levels, i.e., highly agree (3 points), moderately agree (2 points), and slightly agree (1 point). The case is a positive question and interpret the opposite effect for negative questions. All scores were summed up and compared with the specified criteria. by considering the criteria to divide the level of the criteria [9]. Descriptive statistics were analyzed using percentage, mean, median, standard deviation, maximum, minimum, and quality data were analyzed by content analysis.

3. Results

3.1. Results of the Executive Interview

Context evaluation was convened by a meeting to clarify the policy transfer at the provincial level. The quality development policy of Star Hospital is considered as a policy that sets clear guidelines for development, similarly, raises the standards of the Sub-district Hospital to improve service quality. Likewise, keeps people healthy and helps to receive health care in terms of treatment, promotion, prevention, rehabilitation and consumer protection can reduce the congestion of the host hospital to be satisfied with the service recipient. All sectors can provide health services equally for people to have good hygiene.

The input evaluation found that there was still a lack of personnel in both quantity and quality in the operation. As for the budget, there is no central budget support. Sub district Administrative Organization (SAO) had to use the budget from the existing maintenance funds. In addition, the SAO does not have enough tools and equipment to meet the assigned

workload and does not confirm to quality standards of Star Hospital.

The Process evaluation found that no working group was established at the district level. Only some of the work has been integrated between health network partners in the form of joint operations. There is a plan and guidelines for problem management with the community and network partners to jointly think/plan health activities. And there is coordination within the network (mentoring team from the host hospital) and outside the network. In addition, each hospital has a database of target groups.

Product evaluation found that the National Health Security Office (NHSO) has developed infrastructure. To be able to support and provide services to people according to standards in terms of treatment, promotion, prevention, rehabilitation, disease control and consumer protection for health. The service system has been developed including OPD, ER, ANC, WCC, NCD, IT, IC and LAB service tools Counseling, Pharmacy and RDU/SCBA jobs, more people have access to services. Reduce the use of outpatient services at the hospital. As for the provision of services according to community problems One Tambon (meaning sub-district) One Product (OTOP). There are only some areas analyzed by the community. There is still a lack of learning together in the community. OTOP is still an issue in the board's view.

3.2. Results from the Worker's Inquiry

The results of the study found that 54.4% of the villages in the responsible area passed the quality assessment of the Star hospitals in 2019-2021, with an average number of villages in the responsible area of 6.7 villages (S.D=2.5), which consisted of 3-5 villages. Of the 38.2% of villagers, there were average of 6.5 full-time personnel, almost half of Star Hospital had 3-5 Full time personnel (47.1 percent), with public health academics 80.9%, followed by professional nurses (63.2%) and public health officials (52.9%)

As for the opinions of the practitioners in the implementation of Star Hospital development in each aspect, it was found that the sample group had opinions on the development operation. The hospital had a high star in every aspect with contextual opinions. With an average score of 18.6 (S.D=2.2), there were opinions on inputs. With an average score of 34.1 (S.D=2.9), there was an opinion on the process with an average score of 39.3 (S.D=3.9) and an opinion on productivity with an average score of 30.3 (S.D=2.9), as detailed in Table 1.

Table 1: Mean and Standard Deviation of the sample classified by level Opinions on the implementation of the development of Star Hospital in each aspect (n=68)

Operator feedback level in the implementation of the development of the Star hospital in each aspect	Average	S.D	level of opinion
Context (21 points)	18.6	2.2	high
Inputs (39 points)	34.1	2.9	high
Process (45 points)	39.3	3.9	high
Productivity (36 points)s	30.3	2.9	high

Considering the level of opinions of the practitioners in the overall development of Star Hospital, it was found that the sample group 83.8% had a high level of opinion on an average score of 122.4 (S.D = 9.6), a minimum score of 99 and a maximum score of 141, as detailed in Table 2.

Table 2: Number and percentage of the sample classified by operational opinion level develop Star hospital overall (n=68)

Score Level	Quality	Percentage
Low Level (0-84 score)	0	0.0
Moderate (85-112 score)	11	16.2
High level (113-141 score)	57	83.8
Average (Standard Deviation)	122.4	(9.6)
Median (min-max)	123.0	(99-141)

3.3. The results of public inquiry service recipients

Majority of the samples were female (75.8%) with mean age 46.6 years (11.0 S.D.), the lowest age was19 and the highest was 83 years. 42.5% were married and 67.0% were graduated. 46.8% had median income per family 20,178.2 baht (standard deviation 12835.1) with the lowest income of 1,000 baht and the highest of 62,000 baht, 47.8% of them had health insurance benefits, 77.3% of them had health insurance cards. 18.7% of the respondents have congenital disease of which 29.3% diagnosed with diabetes followed by hypertension (25.3%). More than half knew that the service center of Passed Quality Standards of Star Hospital (P.S. Hospital) that used the service passed the quality criteria assessment. Most of the respondents (65.2 %) had received different health services from star hospital. In terms of medical procedures, 88.1% of respondents were taking medications at home, whereas 83.1% of chronic patients receiving medications /medicines same as 81.6% going to the hospital. Regarding the level of awareness of the roles of individuals and families in self-care, it was found that there was a high level of awareness (58.5%), followed by a moderate score of 32.3%, an average score of 13.7 (S.D=2.9), a minimum score of 4 and a maximum score of 17, as detailed in Table 3.

Table 3: Number and percentage of the sample classified by the level of recognition of the role of Individuals and families in self-care overall (n=400)

Score Level	Quantity	Percentage
Low Level (0-9 points)	37	9.3
Intermediate (10-13 points)	129	32.3
Advanced (14-17 points)	234	58.5
Mean (Standard Deviation)	13.7	(2.9)
Median (min-max)	14.0	(4-17)

As for the level of satisfaction in using the service from the hospital, it was found that there was high level of satisfaction, 95.3%, average score 61.2 (S.D = 4.6), lowest score 38 and highest score 66, as detailed in Table 4.

Table 4: Number and percentage of the sample classified by level of satisfaction with use overall service from Sub District Hospital (n=400)

Score Level	Quantity	Percentage
Low Level (0-39 points)	1	0.3
Moderate (40-52 points)	18	4.5
Advanced (53-66 points)	381	95.3
Mean (Standard Deviation)	61.2	(4.6)
Median (min-max)	62.0	(38-66)

4. Discussion

4.1. Conformity with the context

For the opinions of the sample group on the policy of quality development of Star hospital, it was found that most of them were aware of the policy from the provincial policy clarification meeting and can be informed and act accordingly. Quality development of Star Hospital is a concept that focuses on linking the service system, service process, including management. This will result in a systematic management throughout the organization. Focus on the development of service management potential (Human Resources, Premises, Materials, Equipment, Tools). The main goal is for people to receive services in a service place that is well managed, involved, able to manage service systems, finances, structures, locations, and equipment, including support systems. Similarly, enabling service units to work for the people with quality and efficiency that can meet the needs of all target groups in the real area complete as needed in terms of treatment, promotion, prevention, rehabilitation, disease control and consumer health protection. This is consistent with the study by Nongnuch Yamwong and colleagues (2018) [2].

As for the operators, it was found that the majority of the sample groups were agreed on the issue, “Details and guidelines for development work have been clarified Star hospital" (82.4%), followed by very agreed responses on the issue of "development of Star hospital makes people and patients more accessible to health services"

(77.9%) and the issue " Developing a star-studded public hospital is an operation that is in line with the needs of service users" (76.5%). Overall, there was a high level of contextual opinions with a mean score of 18.6 (S.D=2.2), which is consistent with Nanthapat's study. Thirawattanon (2020) found that the sample group was very significant in terms of context in the evaluation of public health performance Nakhon Ratchasima Province [8]. This is because in the implementation of the quality development of the Star Hospital. It is a new policy that the Ministry of Public Health has set in 2017 with an emphasis on the development of the health service system that is conducive and the most beneficial to the people who receive services to be able to access convenient health services, standard quality and is taken care of continuously. Therefore, policies have been clarified at the ministry level, district level, and provincial level [1].

4.2. Conformity with supporting factors

There are 5 categories of criteria, each of which contains details and complex development guidelines, and many of them do not correspond to the readiness of personnel in each SAO. There will only be a large (L) or medium (M) hospital. In some places, there are registered nurses or with multidisciplinary team personnel ready to be able to develop according to the criteria. The allocation of human resources is not adequate especially doctors, dentists, and the potential of the staff in each hospital is not the same, including the lack of support for multi-disciplinary teams, mentors from the host hospital.

As for the budget for the development of a star-studded hospital, there is no centralized budget support. A hospital with enough money to maintain will be able to develop faster . Hospital at Ngern Bamrungnoi, there are many things that the Sub District Administrative Organization (SAO) must develop, such as improve the environment, structure and property to be in line with the standards including the supply of equipment criteria boost tool which all require a budget to supply.

In terms of resources, it was found that, S.P.P. Hospital developed to support the service system from the server in terms of IT, IC, LAB, service tools, pharmaceuticals, and RDU/PCB. Not enough tools and equipment to handle the assigned workload and does not conform to the quality standards of Star Hospital. For the practitioners, it was found that the majority of the sample groups were very agreeable on the issue "There is a clear working manual which can be implemented" (89.7%). Overall, there was a high level of opinion on inputs with a mean score of 34.1 (S.D=2.9), which was different from Nanthapat's study. Thirawattanon (2020) found that in terms of imports, respondents were less

likely to be agreed with the consistency between people and workload in the evaluation of public health performance at Nakhon Ratchasima Province. It can be seen that in the development of quality according to the standards of Star Hospital, personnel, budget and resources factors [3]. It is absolutely necessary to operate. In addition, if there is a lack of participation in the support of the mentoring team and the main hospital, developing according to the quality standards of Star Hospital will be difficult to achieve. This is because of human resources are important factors for the operation of the organization. Whether the organization will be successful or not depends partly on human resource management, consistent with Boontip's study. Likitpongwit and Prasert Inrak (2017) found that one of the factors of excellence in nursing college administration under the Ministry of Public Health is to focus on personnel [5].

4.3. Process Consistency

For the development of the structure according to the standards, focusing on enabling the Hospital to provide services that are necessary. The outdoor environment must be managed and within the workplace according to the 5S standards and to develop toilets to meet the Thai Public Restroom Standards of Healthy Accessibility Safety (HAS).

For the practitioners, it was found that most of the respondents were very much in agreed on the issue “Improving the development of the outdoor environment of the building Implemented the 5S standard and the issue of "developing health service systems such as OPD ER ANC NCD dentistry and Thai traditional medicine that covers all types and populations of all age groups both proactively and reactively.

As for the provision of services according to community problems (OTOP), there are only some areas that have been analyzed by the community. There is still a lack of learning together in the community. OTOP is still an issue in the board's view. The results of the role of individuals and families in self-care found that people were aware of the role of self-care only in some matters, such as diet, exercise, emotional management. But still can't change all behaviors especially the behavior of drinking alcohol and smoking.

In terms of assessing the potential of people and families to take care of their own health, this is the criterion in Category 5. Results of the Quality Improvement Assessment of Star Hospital, almost 60% of people have a high level of self-care awareness. This is because in the operation Emphasis on the development of service system quality in terms of health promotion is still incomplete, therefore Emphasis should be placed on providing close and continuous holistic,

integrated, and integrated care for all citizens at the individual, family and community levels according to the composition UCCARE (U: Unity Team, C: Customer focus, C: Community Participation A: Appreciation, R: Resource Sharing and human development, E: Essential care).

5. Conclusion

Regarding workshop suggestions, there is still a lack of personnel in both quantity and quality; should analyze and evaluate the performance together at the Sub-district or district level to review the causes and solutions as well as analyze strengths, weaknesses, development opportunities, and obstacles, and use them to improve and develop operations to be more effective; coordination between network partners, referral, supervision, return of information to people in the area searching for OTOP issues in the context of the area. For management recommendations, should appoint a working group at the district level which consists of executives, director of the hospital, multi-disciplinary group; at the provincial level, there should be appropriate human resource, budget, and resource management planning according to the context of each area and participation should be strengthened from all sectors both the public sector, the private sector, and the people in the community.

For policy recommendations, drive the District Health System (DHS) mechanism by integrating the quality development work of the Star Hospital as a policy of the network partners at the district level, namely the district chief, district public health, sub-district SAO, Kamnan, and the understanding of the main drivers; determine the policy for developing the quality of STAR. hospitals according to the context of the area with the concept of “Standard Public Office According to Community Based”, which defines the must under the accreditation of the planning committee and assessment at the provincial level is a model of Surat Thani Province; supporting operational policies that focus on providing integrated, holistic care to all groups of people, closely and continuously from the individual, family and community levels according to the composition UCCARE.

For future research, effectiveness of health promotion and treatment services, people's expectation of receiving health services in accordance with the operating standards and a comparative study of the operational outcomes of the sub-district health promoting hospitals that passed and did not pass the quality standard assessment of Star hospital are recommended

Acknowledgement

I would like to express my sincere thanks to all staff of Quality Development Group of Suratthani Provincial Office for developing

the quality of Tambon Health Promoting Hospitals (Subdistrict Hospital) by using the criteria of Star Subdistrict Health Promoting Hospital. I would like to thank the participants for agreeing to participate in my study.

Conflict of Interest

There is no conflict of interest.

Reference

[1] Strategy and Planning Division Ministry of Public Health. (2017). The 20-year National Strategic Plan on Public Health and the Action Plan for Civil Service Certification, 2018. Nonthaburi: Ministry of Public Health.

[2] Nongnuch Yamwong et al. (2018). research project Evaluation of the efficiency of the Three Million Three Years Quit Smoking Project in Thailand in honor of His Majesty the King of Nakhon Nayok Province and Sa Kaeo Province. Research report.

[3] Nantapat Thirawatananon. (2020). public health performance evaluation Nakhon Ratchasima Province. Health Research and Development Journal Nakhon Ratchasima Provincial Public Health Office. 6(1): 90-107.

[4] Net Phetcharasmi The Boonnet family. (2017). Customer satisfaction with the services provided by the outpatient department Nawut Somdet Ya Hospital. Police Nurse Journal. 9(2): 66-75.

[5] Boonthip Likhitpongwit and Prasert Inrak. (2017). Factors of Excellence in Nursing College Administration under the Ministry of Public Health. Journal of the Southern College of Nursing and Public Health Network. 4(1): 117-134.

[6] Panupan Paitoon. (2020). Factors for success driving the operation of the Tid Dao Hospital, Muang Phayao District Phayao Province. Journal of Community Health Sciences. 6(2):168-177.

[7] Surat Thani Provincial Public Health Office. (2019). Summary report of operating results, fiscal year 2019. Surat Thani: Thanyalak Printing.

[8] Suchit Kongchan (2020). Quality Development Assessment of Sub-District Health Promoting Hospitals (Tid Dao Hospital), Songkhla Province. Academic Journal of Maha Sarakham Provincial Public Health Office. 4(8):148-166.

[9] Seri Ratcharot. (1994). Criteria and methods for measuring and evaluating school education. Teaching Documents on Administration and Management of Educational Measurement and Evaluation Unit 3. Sukhothai Thammathirat Open University: Nonthaburi.

[10] Arun Jirawatkul. (2004). Biostatistics for Health Science Research. Khon Kaen: Department of Biostatistics and Demography. Faculty of Public Health Khon Kaen University.

[11] Stufflebeam, D.L. (1983). The CIPP Model of program evaluation In Evaluation Model: Viewpoint on Education and Human Service Evaluation. Madaus G., Scriven M., Stufflebeam, D.L, eds Boston: Kluwer – Nijhoff.